

Biomath Communications

www.biomathforum.org/biomath/index.php/conference

A family of recurrence generated sigmoidal functions based on the Log–logistic function. Some approximation aspects

Nikolay Kyurkchiev^{1,2}, Svetoslav Markov¹ ¹Institute of Mathematics & Informatics Bulgarian Academy of Sciences Acad. G. Bonchev Str., Bl. 8, 1113 Sofia, Bulgaria

²Faculty of Mathematics and Informatics University of Plovdiv Paisii Hilendarski
24 Tzar Asen Str., 4000 Plovdiv, Bulgaria

nkvurk@math.bas.bg, nkvurk@uni-plovdiv.bg, smarkov@bio.bas.bg

Abstract. In this note we construct a family of recurrence generated sigmoidal functions based on the Log–logistic function. The study of some biochemical reactions is linked to a precise Log–logistic function analysis.

We prove estimates for the Hausdorff approximation of the Heaviside step function by means of this family. Numerical examples, illustrating our results are given. The plots are prepared using CAS Mathematica.

Keywords: Log–logistic function \cdot Heaviside step function \cdot Hausdorff distance \cdot Upper and lower bounds.

Citation: Nikolay Kyurkchiev, Svetoslav Markov, A family of recurrence generated sigmoidal functions based on the Log–logistic function. Some approximation aspects, Biomath Communications 5 (2018), http://dx.doi.org/10.11145/bmc.2018.07.197

1 Introduction

The logistic function belongs to the important class of smooth sigmoidal functions arising from population and cell growth models.

The logistic function was introduced by Pierre François Verhulst [1]–[3], who applied it to human population dynamics. Verhulst proposed his logistic equation to describe the mechanism of the self-limiting growth of a biological population. His equation was rediscovered by A. G. McKendrick [4] for the bacterial growth in broth and was tested using nonlinear parameter identification.

Since then the logistic function finds applications in many scientific fields, including biology, ecology, population dynamics, chemistry, demography, economics, geoscience, mathematical psychology, probability, sociology, political science, financial mathematics, statistics, fuzzy set theory, insurance mathematics, debugging and test theory to name a few [5]–[37].

Logistic functions are also used in artificial neural networks [38]– [46]. Constructive approximation by superposition of sigmoidal functions and the relation with neural networks and radial basis functions approximations is discussed in [42].

Any neural net element computes a linear combination of its input signals, and uses a logistic function to produce the result; often called "activation" function [47]–[50].

The Log-logistic distribution (also known as the Fisk distribution [51]) is a widely used lifetime distribution. For other results, see [53].

The distribution is used to model in fields such as biostatistics, population dynamic, medical research [52] and economics. For the quadratic transmuted family, see Shaw et Buckley [54]. Shaw et al. [54], Gupta et al. [55] study a new model which generalizes the Log-logistic function [56]. For some kinetics interpretation of Log-logistic models, see [57]–[60].

Many biochemical reactions involve binding of a smaller molecule L (called ligand) to a large macromolecule P

$$L + P \longleftrightarrow LP$$
.

The oxygen binds to haemoglobin is one of the most important biochemical reactions [60]. The proportion of the bound macromolecules is defined by $\theta = \frac{[LP]}{[P]+[LP]}$. For arbitrary *n* from the reaction:

$$nL + P \longleftrightarrow L_n P$$
,

the proportion is described by a Hill's formula $\theta = \frac{[L]^n}{K + [L]^n}$, where K and n are empirical parameters. The study of this biochemical reaction is linked to a precise Log-logistic function analysis [61].

Some applications of the Log–logistic and transmuted Log–logistic sigmoids can be found in [61]. Another application area is medicine, where the logistic function is used to model the growth of tumors or to study pharmacokinetic reactions.

Preliminaries 2

Definition 1. Define the Log-logistic function as

$$M_0(t) = \frac{t^\beta}{\alpha^\beta + t^\beta} = 1 - \frac{1}{1 + \left(\frac{t}{\alpha}\right)^\beta} \tag{1}$$

where α is a scale parameter.

Evidently, $M_0(\alpha) = \frac{1}{2}$.

Definition 2. The (basic) step function is:

$$h_{\alpha}(t) = \begin{cases} 0, & \text{if } t < \alpha, \\ [0,1], & \text{if } t = \alpha, \\ 1, & \text{if } t > \alpha, \end{cases}$$

usually known as shifted Heaviside step function.

Definition 3. [62] The Hausdorff distance (the H-distance) [62] $\rho(f, g)$ between two interval functions f, g on $\Omega \subseteq \mathbb{R}$, is the distance between their completed graphs F(f) and F(g) considered as closed subsets of $\Omega \times \mathbb{R}$. More precisely,

$$\rho(f,g) = \max\{\sup_{A \in F(f)} \inf_{B \in F(g)} ||A - B||, \sup_{B \in F(g)} \inf_{A \in F(f)} ||A - B||\}, \quad (2)$$

wherein ||.|| is any norm in \mathbb{R}^2 , e. g. the maximum norm $||(t,x)|| = \max\{|t|, |x|\}$; hence the distance between the points $A = (t_A, x_A)$, $B = (t_B, x_B)$ in \mathbb{R}^2 is $||A - B|| = \max(|t_A - t_B|, |x_A - x_B|)$.

The Hausdorff approximation of the Heaviside step function by Loglogistic functions of the form (1) is considered in [61] and the following is proved:

Theorem A. [61] The H-distance $d_0 = \rho(h_\alpha, M_0)$ between the Heaviside step function h_α and the Log–logistic function M_0 can be expressed for $\frac{\beta}{\alpha} \geq 2$ as follows:

$$d_{l_0} = \frac{1}{1 + \frac{\beta}{\alpha}} < d_0 < \frac{\ln\left(1 + \frac{\beta}{\alpha}\right)}{1 + \frac{\beta}{\alpha}} = d_{r_0},\tag{3}$$

$$\tilde{d}_{l_0} = \frac{\ln(1+\frac{\beta}{\alpha})}{1+\frac{\beta}{\alpha}} - \frac{\ln\ln(1+\frac{\beta}{\alpha})}{(1+\frac{\beta}{\alpha})\left(1+\frac{1}{\ln(1+\frac{\beta}{\alpha})}\right)} < d_0 < \frac{\ln(1+\frac{\beta}{\alpha})}{1+\frac{\beta}{\alpha}} + \frac{\ln\ln(1+\frac{\beta}{\alpha})}{(1+\frac{\beta}{\alpha})\left(\frac{\ln\ln(1+\frac{\beta}{\alpha})}{1-\ln(1+\frac{\beta}{\alpha})} - 1\right)} = \tilde{d}_{r_0}.$$
(4)

3 Main Results

Let us consider the following family of recurrence generated sigmoidal Log–logistic functions

$$M_{i+1}(t) = 1 - \frac{1}{1 + \left(t + \frac{1}{2} - \alpha + M_i(t)\right)^{\beta}}, \quad i = 0, 1, 2, \dots,$$
 (5)

with

$$M_{i+1}(\alpha) = \frac{1}{2}, \quad i = 0, 1, 2, \dots,$$
 (6)

based on the Log-logistic function $M_0(t)$.

Let p is the number of recurrences in (5). For p = 0, we get the estimates from Theorem A.

The case p = 1. In the case of one recursion (p = 1, or the same as i = 0) from (5)–(6) we get:

$$M_{1}(t) = 1 - \frac{1}{1 + \left(t + \frac{1}{2} - \alpha + M_{0}(t)\right)^{\beta}}$$

= $1 - \frac{1}{1 + \left(t + \frac{3}{2} - \alpha - \frac{1}{1 + \left(\frac{t}{\alpha}\right)^{\beta}}\right)^{\beta}}.$ (7)

The H-distance $d_1 = \rho(h_\alpha, M_1)$ between the Heaviside step function h_α and the sigmoidal function M_1 satisfies the relation:

$$M_1(\alpha + d_1) = 1 - \frac{1}{1 + \left(d_1 + \frac{3}{2} - \frac{1}{1 + \left(1 + \frac{d_1}{\alpha}\right)^{\beta}}\right)^{\beta}} = 1 - d_1.$$
(8)

The following theorem is valid

Theorem B. The *H*-distance d_1 between the function h_{α} and the function M_1 can be expressed for $\beta \left(1 + \frac{\beta}{4\alpha}\right) \geq 2$ as follows:

$$d_{l_1} = \frac{1}{1 + \beta + \frac{\beta^2}{4\alpha}} < d_1 < \frac{\ln\left(1 + \beta + \frac{\beta^2}{4\alpha}\right)}{1 + \beta + \frac{\beta^2}{4\alpha}} = d_{r_1}.$$
 (9)

Proof. From (8) we find

$$\ln \frac{1 - d_1}{d_1} = \beta \ln \left(d_1 + \frac{3}{2} - \frac{1}{1 + \left(1 + \frac{d_1}{\alpha}\right)^{\beta}} \right).$$

We examine the function

$$F(d_1) = \beta \ln\left(d_1 + \frac{3}{2} - \frac{1}{1 + \left(1 + \frac{d_1}{\alpha}\right)^{\beta}}\right) - \ln(1 - d_1) - \ln\frac{1}{d_1}.$$

From $F'(d_1) > 0$ we conclude that function F is increasing.

Consider the function

$$G(d_1) = \left(1 + \beta + \frac{\beta^2}{4\alpha}\right) d_1 - \ln\frac{1}{d_1}.$$
(10)

From Taylor expansion we obtain $G(d_1) - F(d_1) = O(d^2)$. Hence $G(d_1)$ approximates $F(d_1)$ with $d_1 \to 0$ as $O(d_1^2)$ (see Fig. 1).

In addition, from

$$G'(d_1) = 1 + \beta + \frac{\beta^2}{4\alpha} + \frac{1}{d_1} > 0$$

we conclude that the function G is increasing.

Further, for $\beta \left(1 + \frac{\beta}{4\alpha}\right) \geq 2$ we have

$$G\left(\frac{1}{1+\beta+\frac{\beta^2}{4\alpha}}\right) = 1 - \ln\left(1+\beta+\frac{\beta^2}{4\alpha}\right) < 0,$$
$$G\left(\frac{\ln\left(1+\beta+\frac{\beta^2}{4\alpha}\right)}{1+\beta+\frac{\beta^2}{4\alpha}}\right) = \ln\ln\left(1+\beta+\frac{\beta^2}{4\alpha}\right) > 0.$$

This completes the proof of the theorem.

The function M_1 for $\alpha = 0.6$; $\beta = 7$ is visualized on Fig. 2.



Figure 1: The functions $F(d_1)$ and $G(d_1)$.



Figure 2: The function M_1) for $\alpha = 0.6$; $\beta = 7$; Hausdorff distance $d_1 = 0.104494$; $d_{l_1} = 0.0351906$; $d_{r_1} = 0.117782$.



Figure 3: The recurrence generated sigmoidal Log–logistic functions: $M_0(t)$ (red), $M_1(t)$ (green), $M_2(t)$ (dashed) and $M_3(t)$ (thick).

From the nonlinear equation (8) and inequalities (9) we have: $d_1 = 0.104494$; $d_{l_1} = 0.0351906$; $d_{r_1} = 0.117782$.

The recurrence generated sigmoidal Log–logistic functions: $M_0(t)$, $M_1(t)$, $M_2(t)$ and $M_3(t)$ are visualized on Fig. 3

Remark.

For each p, based on the methodology proposed in the present note, the reader may formulate the corresponding approximation problems on his/her own.

3. Conclusions

To achieve our goal, we obtain new estimates for the H-distance between a step function and its best approximating family of recurrence generated sigmoidal Log–logistic functions.

Numerical examples, illustrating our results are given.

We propose a software module (intellectual properties) within the programming environment *CAS Mathematica* for the analysis of the considered family of Log–logistic functions.

The module offers the following possibilities:

- generation of the logistic functions under user defined values of the parameters α and β and number of recursions p;

- calculation of the H-distance $d_p = \rho(h_\alpha, M_p), p = 0, 1, 2, ..., p$ between the Heaviside function h_α and the sigmoidal functions $M_0, M_1, M_2, ..., M_p$;

- software tools for animation and visualization.

```
Clear[a];
```

Clear [^β];

```
\begin{split} & \texttt{Manipulate[Dynamic@Show[Plot[f[t], {t, 0, 2}, \\ & \texttt{LabelStyle} \rightarrow \texttt{Directive[Blue, Bold], } \\ & \texttt{PlotLabel} \rightarrow 1 - 1/(1 + (t + 1/2 - \alpha + 1 - 1/(1 + (t + 1/2 - \alpha + 1 - 1/(1 + (t / \alpha)^{\beta}))^{\beta}))^{\beta})], \\ & \texttt{PlotRange} \rightarrow \{\texttt{Automatic}, \{0, 1\}\}], \\ & \{\{\alpha, 0.3\}, 0.01, 10, \texttt{Appearance} \rightarrow "Open"\}, \\ & \{\{\beta, 0.5\}, 0.01, 10, \texttt{Appearance} \rightarrow "Open"\}, \\ & \texttt{Initialization} \Rightarrow \end{split}
```

 $(\mathbf{f}[t_{-}] := 1 - 1/(1 + (t + 1/2 - \alpha + 1 - 1/(1 + (t + 1/2 - \alpha + 1 - 1/(1 + (t/\alpha)^{\beta}))^{\beta})))$



Figure 4: An example of the usage of dynamical and graphical representation for the family $M_{i+1}(t)$. For example p = 2; i = 1, $\alpha = 0.6$, $\beta = 7$; Hausdorff distance $d_2 = 0.073621$. The plots are prepared using CAS Mathematica.

References

- P.-F. Verhulst, Notice Sur la Loi Que la Population Poursuit dans Son Accroissement, Correspondance Mathematique et Physique 10, 113–121 (1838).
- [2] P.-F. Verhulst, Recherches Mathematiques sur la Loi D'accroissement de la Population (Mathematical Researches into the Law of Population Growth Increase), Nouveaux Memoires de l'Academie Royale des Sciences et Belles-Lettres de Bruxelles 18, 1–42 (1845)
- [3] P.-F. Verhulst, Deuxieme Memoire sur la Loi D'accroissement de la Population, Memoires de l'Academie Royale des Sciences, des Lettres et des Beaux-Arts de Belgique 20, 1–32 (1847)
- [4] A. G. McKendrick, M. Kesava Pai, The Rate of Multiplication of Micro-organisms: A Mathematical Study, Proc. of the Royal Society of Edinburgh 31, 649–653 (1912). http://dx.doi.org/10.1017/S0370164600025426
- R. Alt, S. Markov, Theoretical and Computational Studies of some Bioreactor Models, Computers and Mathematics with Applications 64, 350-360 (2012) http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.camwa.2012.02.046
- [6] R. Anguelov, S. Markov, Hausdorff Continuous Interval Functions and Approximations, In: M. Nehmeier et al. (Eds), Scientific Computing, Computer Arithmetic, and Validated Numerics, 16th International Symposium, SCAN 2014, LNCS 9553, 3–13, 2016, Springer. DOI: 10.1007/978-3-319-31769-4
- [7] N. Kyurkchiev, S. Markov, On the numerical solution of the general kinetic K-angle reaction system, J. Math. Chem. 54 (3), (2016), 792–805
- [8] G. Lente, Deterministic Kinetics in Chemistry and Systems Biology, Springer, New York, 2015

- [9] A. M. Bersani, G. Dell'Acqua, Is there anything left to say on enzyme kinetic constants and quasi-steady state approximation?, J. Math. Chem. 50, 335-344 (2012)
- J. Dombi, Z. Gera, The approximation of piecewise linear membership functions and Likasiewicz operators, Fuzzy Sets and Systems 154, 275–286 (2005)
 http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.fss.2005.02.016
- [11] S. Adam, G. Magoulas, D. Karras, M. Vrahatis, Bounding the search space for global optimization of neural networks learning error: an interval analysis approach, J. of Machine Learning Research, 17, (2016), 1–40
- [12] Z. Quan, Z. Zhang, The construction and approximation of the neural network with two weights, J. Appl. Math., 2014; http://dx.doi.org./10.1155/2014/892653
- [13] N. Kyurkchiev, Mathematical Concepts in Insurance and Reinsurance. Some Moduli in Programming Environment MATHE-MATICA, LAP LAMBERT Academic Publishing, Saarbrucken, 136 pp., 2016
- [14] N. Kyurkchiev, S. Markov, Sigmoid functions: Some Approximation and Modelling Aspects. (LAP LAMBERT Academic Publishing, Saarbrucken, 2015); ISBN 978-3-659-76045-7.
- [15] N. Kyurkchiev, S. Markov, On the Hausdorff distance between the Heaviside step function and Verhulst logistic function. J. Math. Chem., 54 (1), 109–119 (2016); DOI:10.1007/S10910-015-0552-0
- [16] A. Iliev, N. Kyurkchiev, S. Markov, On the Approximation of the step function by some sigmoid functions, Mathematics and Computers in Simulation, 2015; DOI: http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.matcom.2015.11.005

- [17] Kyurkchiev, N., A new transmuted cumulative distribution function based on the Verhulst logistic function with application in population dynamics. Biomath Communications, 4, 1, 2017, ISSN:2367-5233
- [18] N. Kyurkchiev, А class of activation funcnew the J. tion based on correcting amendments Int. for and Developments, (2),Sci. Res. 6 2018,565 - 568;http://www.ijsrd.com/articles/IJSRDV6I20203.pdf
- [19] N.Kyurkchiev, The new transmuted C.D.F. based on Gompertz function, Biomath Communications, 5 (1), 2018.
- [20] V. Kyurkchiev, N. Kyurkchiev, A Family of Recurrence Generated Functions Based on "Half-Hyperbolic Tangent Activation Function". Biomedical Statistics and Informatics, 2, 3, 2017, 87-94
- [21] Iliev, A., N. Kyurkchiev, S. Markov, A Note on the New Activation Function of Gompertz Type, Biomath Communications, Vol 4, No 2 (2017), ISSN 2367-5233.
- [22] V. Kyurkchiev, A. Iliev, N. Kyurkchiev, Applications of Some New Transmuted Cumulative Distribution Functions in Population Dynamics, Journal of Bioinformatics and Genomics (JBG), 1 (3), 2017, ISSN (Online): 2530-1381
- [23] A. Iliev, N. Kyurkchiev, S. Markov, On the Approximation of the Cut and Step Functions by Logistic and Gompertz Functions, Biomath, 4 (2), 2015, 1–12.
- [24] C. Dufourd, C. Weldon, R. Anguelov, Y. Dumont, Parameter identification in population models for insects using trap data, Biomath 2, 2013.
- [25] R. Anguelov, A. Bastos, Can mathematics be biology's next microscope in disease research at the interface, Biomath 5 (2), 2016.

- [26] J. D. Musa, A. Ianino, K. Okumoto, Software Reliability: Measurement, Prediction, Applications, McGraw-Hill, 1987.
- [27] H. Pham, System Software Reliability, In: Springer Series in Reliability Engineering, Springer–Verlag London Limited, 2006.
- [28] S. Yamada, Software Reliability Modeling: Fundamentals and Applications, Springer 2014.
- [29] S. Yamada, Y. Tamura, OSS Reliability Measurement and Assessment, In: Springer Series in Reliability Engineering (H. Pham, Ed.), Springer International Publishing Switzerland, 2016.
- [30] A. Pandey, N. Goyal, Early Software Reliability Prediction. A Fuzzy Logic Approach, In: Studies in Fuzziness and Soft Computing (J. Kacprzyk, Ed.), vol. 303, Springer, London, 2013.
- [31] P. K. Kapur, H. Pham, A. Gupta, P. C. Jha, Software Reliability Assessment with OR Applications, In: Springer Series in Reliability Engineering, Springer-Verlag, London, 2011.
- [32] M. Bisi, N. Goyal, Artificial Neural Network for Software Reliability Prediction, In: Performability Engineering Series (K. Misra and J. Andrews, Eds.), John Wiley & Sons, Inc., New Jersey, 2017.
- [33] V. Ivanov, A. Reznik, G. Succi, Comparing the reliability of software systems: A case study on mobile operating systems, Information Sciences, 423, 2018, 398–411.
- [34] N. Pavlov, G. Spasov, A. Rahnev, N. Kyurkchiev, A new class of Gompertz-type software reliability models, International Electronic Journal of Pure and Applied Mathematics, vol. 12 (1), 2018, 43–57.
- [35] N. Pavlov, G. Spasov, A. Rahnev, N. Kyurkchiev, Some deterministic reliability growth curves for software error detection:

Approximation and modeling aspects, International Journal of Pure and Applied Mathematics, vol. 118 (3), 2018, 599–611.

- [36] N. Pavlov, A. Iliev, A. Rahnev, N. Kyurkchiev, Some software reliability models: Approximation and modeling aspects, LAP LAMBERT Academic Publishing, 2018, ISBN: 978-613-9-82805-0
- [37] N. Pavlov, A. Iliev, A. Rahnev, N. Kyurkchiev, Nonstandard Models in Debbuging Theory (Part 2), LAP LAMBERT Academic Publishing, 2018, ISBN: 978-613-9-87794-2.
- [38] Z. Chen, F. Cao, The Approximation Operators with Sigmoidal Functions, Computers & Mathematics with Applications 58, 758-765 (2009), http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.camwa.2009.05.001
- [39] Z. Chen, F. Cao, The Construction and Approximation of a Class of Neural Networks Operators with Ramp Functions, Journal of Computational Analysis and Applications 14, 101–112 (2012)
- [40] Z. Chen, F. Cao, J. Hu, Approximation by Network Operators with Logistic Activation Functions, Applied Mathematics and Computation 256, 565-571 (2015), http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.amc.2015.01.049
- [41] D. Costarelli, R. Spigler, Approximation Results for Neural Network Operators Activated by Sigmoidal Functions, Neural Networks 44, 101–106 (2013)
 http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.neunet.2013.03.015
- [42] D. Costarelli, R. Spigler, Constructive Approximation by Superposition of Sigmoidal Functions, Anal. Theory Appl. 29, 169–196 (2013), http://dx.doi.org/10.4208/ata.2013.v29.n2.8

- [43] D. Costarelli, G. Vinti, Pointwise and uniform approximation by multivariate neural network operators of the max-product type, Neural Networks, 2016; doi:10.1016/j.neunet.2016.06.002; http://www.sciencedirect.com/science/article/pii/S0893608016300685.
- [44] D. Costarelli, R. Spigler, Solving numerically nonbalance linear systems of laws by multivariate sigmoidal functions approximation, Computational and Applied Mathematics 2016;DOI:10.1007/s40314-016-0334-8 http://link.springer.com/article/10.1007/s40314-016-0334-8
- [45] D. Costarelli, G. Vinti, Convergence for a family of neural network operators in Orlicz spaces, Mathematische Nachrichten 2016; doi:10.1002/mana.20160006
- [46] N. Guliyev, V. Ismailov, A single hidden layer feedforward network with only one neuron in the hidden layer san approximate any univariate function, Neural Computation, 28 2016, 1289– 1304.
- [47] D. Elliott. А better activation function for artificial neural networks. the National Science Foundation. Institute for Systems Research. Washing-DC, ISR Technical Rep. TR-6, 1993.Available: ton, http://ufnalski.edu.pl/zne/ci_2014/papers/Elliott_TR_93-8.pdf
- [48] K. Edla. New algebraic Babu. D. activation function for multi-layered feed forward neural net-IETE works. Journal of Research. 2016.Available: http://dx.doi.org/0.1080/03772063.2016.1240633
- [49] N. Kyurkchiev, S. Markov, Hausdorff approximation of the sign function by some activation functions, Biomath Communications, 2016
- [50] N. Kyurkchiev, N., A. Iliev, S. Markov, Some Techniques for Recurrence Generating of Activation Functions: Some Modeling

and Approximation Aspects, LAP LAMBERT Academic Publishing, 2017, ISBN: 978-3-330-33143-3

- [51] Fisk, P. R., The Graduation of Income Distribution, Econometrica, 29 (2), 1961, 171–185.
- [52] Collet, D., Modelling Survival Data in Medical Research, (2nd ed.), 2003, CRC press, ISBN 1–58488–325–1.
- [53] N. Pavlov, A. Golev, A. Iliev, A. Rahnev, N. Kyurkchiev, On the Kumaraswamy-Dagum log-logistic sigmoid function with applications to population dynamics, Biomath Communications, 5 (1), 2018
- [54] Shaw, W. T., I. R. Buckley, The alchemy of probability distributions: beyond Gram–Charlier expansions, and skew–kurtotic– normal distribution from a rank transmutation map, 2007, UCL discovery repository; http://discovery.ucl.uk/id/eprint/643923
- [55] Gupta, R. C., O. Acman, S. Lvin, A study of log-logistic model in survival analysis, Biometrica Journal, 41 (4), 1999, 431–443.
- [56] Aryal, G, Transmuted Log-logistic Distribution, J. of Statistics Applications and Probability, 2 (1), 2015, 11–20.
- [57] A. K. Hill, The possible effects of the aggregation of the molecules of haemoglobin on its dissociation curves, The Journal of Physiology, 40 (Suppl.), IV–VII, 1910.
- [58] W. Focke, I. van der Westhuizen, N. Musee, M. Loots, Kinetic interpretation of log-logistic dose-time response curves, Scientific Reports, 7, Article number:2234; (2017).
- [59] Z. Konkoli, Safe uses of Hill's model: an exact comparison with the Adair–Klotz model, Theoretical Biology and Medical Modelling, 2011.
- [60] A. Ortiz, Derivation of Hill's equation from scale invariance, Journal of Uncertain Systems, 7 (3), 2013, 198–202.

- [61] S. Markov, N. Kyurkchiev, A. Iliev, A. Rahnev, A note on the Log–logistic and transmuted Log–logistic Models. Some applications, Dynamic Systems and Applications, 27 (3), 2018, 593–607.
- [62] F. Hausdorff, Set Theory (2 ed.) (Chelsea Publ., New York, (1962 [1957]) (Republished by AMS-Chelsea 2005), ISBN: 978– 0–821–83835–8.